

Global Medical Ethics Day Symposium

«Teaching Medical Ethics in Lebanese Medical Schools »

American University of Beirut

*Medical Ethics at the Faculty of Medicine
Lebanese University*

Fadi Abou-Mrad MD, PhD

Neurology

Medical Ethics & Law

Educate Medical Ethics
Vision of Lebanese University
In the Quest of the Human Person!

Ethics as viewed by Paul Ricoeur is a requirement not only in health sectors but also for all those who must take decisions **where values are implied**.

Educate Medical Ethics
Vision of Lebanese University
In the Quest of the Human Person!

If all that matters is material one would ask
what is a value or where are the values?

Educate Medical Ethics
Vision of Lebanese University
In the Quest of the Human Person!

The least virus changes the greatest wise person in the world into a fool!

Educate Medical Ethics
Vision of Lebanese University
In the Quest of the Human Person!

- Human Person is the source & foundation of every ethics that would *“delve in the desire of accomplishment & the wish of realization.”*
- This concept of Person is going through a **specific crisis** caused by a number of factors.

Educate Medical Ethics
Vision of Lebanese University
Lebanese Flagrant Elements

Weakening of the practice of civic education &
religious catechism & the lack of sense of patriotism

Educate Medical Ethics

Vision of Lebanese University

Lebanese Flagrant Elements

The respect of the values of Man regardless of faith, religion or political positioning seems to be threatened by **fanaticism** of every person attached to its opinion and believes.

Religious definitions are evident postulates; however the required issue is to define **the way of translating them within the Lebanese society**

Educate Medical Ethics
Vision of Lebanese University
Lebanese Flagrant Elements

Violence perpetrated against the other creates an intended violent reaction leading this other to become in Lebanon a social or partial sectarian bloc who practices ceaselessly violence and takes part in confrontation denying freedom, values, capacity, vivacity and human dialog

Educate Medical Ethics
Vision of Lebanese University
Lebanese Flagrant Elements

Civil war has deepened a negative culture towards the human values that are in continuous decadance.

Educate Medical Ethics
Vision of Lebanese University
Value of a Sickness

There is much pain that even the integrity and the **value of a person or sickness** become trivial matters.

Educate Medical Ethics

Vision of Lebanese University

Ethics Domain

- The Shiite Spiritual Reference Mohamed Hussein Fadlallah affirms that *“the Man of Lebanon in spite of being a cultivated person, collapses when he faces problems because he is no more than a religious person belonging to a particular community”*.
- The attachment to a religious community which provides warmth and tranquility **didn't help the country to live in peace.**
- Père Ducruet sees that *“religions impregnate the behavior of believers. They have coherence with regard to a number of fundamental principles of life however they do not imply ethics in the real sense of the word, because they are not enough to structure by themselves an anthropology”*.

Educate Medical Ethics Vision of Lebanese University Current Challenge

The current problem is to think Consent Release emanating from autonomy (Relation body & spirit)

(Philosophy / Juridical / Ethical)

To neutralize Paternalism of Latin countries (that has had a big impact on the Lebanese Physicians) while caring for patients suffering from distress or danger

In a Society pushing to the extreme the notion of Risk, Responsibility and Precaution

→ **which affected the nature of the social bond in the field of health.**

Multidisciplinary approaches to **Medicine** and its **Social Implication** is becoming an urgent key need.

Educate Medical Ethics Vision of Lebanese University Multidisciplinary Action

Philosophy : ↓ Religious, ↑ Spirituality, ↑ Ethics, ↑ Metaphysics

« Soul & Body are one and the same think »

« I am my brain therefore I think »

Soul → ← **Body** (Somatic)

[Have pain in my leg not my leg has pain]

« *While assuming a responsibility within a community of persons* ».

Juridical : Acquire the necessary expertise for legislation in the public health sector/ Biolaws brought about by tension, agitation, conflict and dramatic situation.

Educate Medical Ethics Vision of Lebanese University Multidisciplinary Action

Social

Dialog in a society of violence.

Justice does not exist → *It must be done*

*Do you prefer justice or security? It is not an idea but a
desire*

It is because we **desire** something that we give it **value**

*To be open to differences and to understand and accept the
others / Remain human in order to achieve a **social cohesion***

***Every society deserves the life and death which it
prepares for!***

Educate Medical Ethics

Vision of Lebanese University

Multidisciplinary Action

Medicine

Corpus exceeding the mere knowledge / M.Tech
The idea that a Neurologist is by no means a Psychiatrist
is very troubling.

Avoid **Specialism** « Neurologism »

2+2 = 4 (If why answer is not neuro)

Brain1 idea A /Brain 2 idea B → Neurology confirm neural integrity

*But Neuro can't say which idea is better. **Face Idea A to B → History***

Neuro has to work on « Myself » otherwise it is never a bridge to good
medicine.

**Ethics bothers physicians who substitute medicine to
technics that are never absolute.**

Educate Medical Ethics

Vision of Lebanese University

Multidisciplinary Action

- Since Antiquity until the 19th century, Medical Ethics was an integrated part of medical formation
- For centuries, Medical studies consisted not only of biological sciences but also of human sciences
- Positivism in the 19th century led however to the oblivion of the human sciences
- The person has been driven out of its body
 - to bring it back to that body in **a relation which raises forgotten questions**

University Committee of Medical Ethics & Bioethics
CUEMB

Established in Sept.2008 by a Decree :

20 membres multidisciplinaires

University Committee of Medical Ethics & Bioethics
CUEMB

University

Academic

Pedagogical

Consultative

Research

University Committee of Medical Ethics & Bioethics

CUEMB

Rationales

- Complexity of problems
- Variety of options
- Protection and safe guarding of Human subject
- Nature of judgments in clinical decision
- Emergence of autonomy
- Encouraging the social leaders in order to give benefits to the cultural diversity which characterize the country

University Committee of Medical Ethics & Bioethics CUEMB

Objectives / Interfaculty Team

- **Circle of thinkers / Forum for social debates**

 - Current problems of the Lebanese Law Project on Medical Assisted Procreation (March 2009)

 - Educate in Bioethics: Vision of the LU (May 09)

 - Human Person: Existence & the Will to be (Oct.09)

- **Pedagogy of Ethics**

 - Common course

 - Specialized Courses (Medicine, Dentist, Pharmacy, Law)

- **Research**

 - Competence of Lebanon in the framework of cultural diversity

 - Beginning of Life, Organ donations, End of Life, Confidentiality

Commission Universitaire d'Éthique Médicale & Bioéthique

Objectives / Interfaculty Team

- **Seminars: Spreading knowledge, Social Debates**

 - Huntington Disease: Ethical Challenges (Feb 09)

 - Multidisciplinary Debates on key Bioethical concepts (March 08)

 - FD meeting on Pharmacovigilance (June 09)

 - Multidisciplinary Debates to present the research of the CUEMB members (Nov 09)

 - Legal Medicine & Medical Ethics (Dec.09)

- **Interuniversity exchanges National & International**

 - European Network "*Edubioethics*"

FSM, Dentist, Pharmacy, Health, Sciences, Law, Engineer, Sociology, Human Sciences

Commission Universitaire d'Éthique Médicale & Bioéthique
EDUBIOETHICS

9 European Universities

+

University of Montreal

+

University of Cleveland

+

Lebanese University

University Committee of Medical Ethics & Bioethics
CUEMB

Begining of Life → Rome

Organ Donations → Salamanca

End of Life → Paris

University Committee of Medical Ethics & Bioethics
CUEMB

Established a Lebanese bibliography on 3 dynamic themes that are permanently renewed on the web site of Paris Descartes

Spreading the thoughts and reflections on particular bioethical concepts in two books published by L'Harmattan, Paris 2008 / Salamanca University 2008

Faculty of Medicine

Educate in Medical Ethics

Purposes & Principles

- To expose the students to the major ethical principles & issues
- Give students familiarity with the central concepts of Bioethics, professionalism and health jurisprudence
- Ethics contributes to high quality patient care and professional behavior.

Methods

- Some of these sessions are given by *single lectures*
- Other are *team taught*
- Some involve multidisciplinary *panels*
- Teaching also includes small group, case-based *seminars* & *workshops*
- Goal is teaching ethics in the *hospital or on a ward-basis* so that students gain more responsibility for the care of patients.
- During the clinical years seminars are organized discussing not only the situation of the patients but also their environment & social values.

Faculty of Medicine

Educate in Bioethics

We believe that Ethics finds naturally its source of reflection in Action

Therefore the more the student is in direct contact with the action the more he/she would appreciate the variety of the raised questions & challenges.

Ethics formation is provided in three stages:

- Preclinical: Scheduled over 5 years
Second Y.(40H), Fourth Y.(14H), Fifth Y.(10H)
64 Hours
- Clinical: Six and Seventh Year Internship (20H)
3 obligatory FD meetings
- Postgraduate:
Seminars on Burning Issues
Ethical Analysis at Interdepartmental Rounds

Faculty of Medicine

Educate in Bioethics

The Curricula leads:

To distinguish between **deontological ethics & teleological ethics** where actions are determined and justified by the consequence of the acts. (Duty / consequentialism)

To examine the fundamental principles & values of justification (Dignity, Autonomy & Justice...)

To determine the relation of the Medical Ethics to Laws & jurisprudence as well as psychology, philosophy, sociology, theology and biology

To utilize ethical principles as guidelines for decision making when caring for patients or approaching ethical dilemmas

To assess the independence of the Medical Ethics vis-à-vis the conceptual factors (ideals) or material factors (economy, politics, philosophy, theology,...) & also within the framework of new methods of diagnostic & new therapeutic possibilities (*IVF, Prenatal Diagnosis, Consent, Biomedical Research...*)

Faculty of Medicine

Educate in Bioethics / Curricula

A- Second Year (40H) In the framework of elementary preclinical courses we study

I- Introduction (1H)

II- Common Terms of Modern Ethics & Bioethics (2H)

III- History & the Structure of Medical Ethics (4H)

III.1- Corpus Hippocratum, its obligations & prohibitions

III.2- Deontological texts of the Corpus Hippocratum

IV- Concept of Human Person / Elements of the body & Medicine (23H)

IV.1- The Vision of the Person: Spirit, Body and Foundation of Ethics (2H)

IV.2- Philosophical Trends and their influence on the understanding of Medicine,
Medical behavior as well as on Physician-Patient Relationship (2H)

IV.3- Impact of Religion and Culture on Medical Ethics (2H)

IV.4- Human Behavior and the Will to Be (2H)

IV.5- Medical Profession in the History / Development of Medical Studies (3H)

IV.6- Development of Health Care Institutions (2H)

IV.7- Parenthood and Genetics / Access to Genome and the Person/Legislation (3H)

IV.8- Medically Assisted Procreation (MAP), Embryos, Gametes/Future/Legislation (3H)

IV.9- Abortion / Legislation (2H)

IV.10- Donation in Medical Practice (2H)

Faculty of Medicine

Educate in Bioethics / Curricula

A- Second Year (40H)

V- BIOLAW: National and International Guidelines and Regulations (10 H)

V.1- Human Rights (2H)

V.2- Code of Thomas Percival on Medical Ethics that is still influencing the Anglo-Saxon world since 1803 (1H)

V.3- Code of Nuremberg (2H)

V.4- Helsinki & its Versions (2H)

V.5- Belmont Report (1H)

V.6- Lebanese Deontological Code (2H)

Faculty of Medicine

Educate in Bioethics / Curricula

B- Fourth Year (14H)

VI- Relation between Caregivers & Patients, Ethical and Social Challenges (14H)

- VI.1- Medical File, Patients Information (2H)
- VI.2- The individual and its requirement of knowledge? (2H)
- VI.3- Confidentiality (2H)
- VI.4- Information/ Consent release for Care / Legislations (2H)
- VI.5- Medical Consultation (2H)
- VI.6- Medical Certificates / Legal Medical Challenges of different Certificates
- VI.7- Lebanese Law 2004 on Patient's Rights (2H)

Faculty of Medicine

Educate in Bioethics / Curricula

C- Fifth Year (10 H)

- VII.1- Announcing a Difficult Diagnosis: Case Studies (2H)
- VII.2- Death: Cerebral Death, Individual Death (2H)
- VII.3- Euthanasia (2H)
- VII.4- End of Life (Palliative Care (2H) / Limits of Care (2H))

Faculty of Medicine

Educate in Bioethics / Curricula

D- Internship : 6th & 7th Year (20H)

VIII- Biomedical Research and Medical Ethics (20H)

- VIII.1- Ethics of Research and the Person (2H)
- VIII.2- Experimental Medicine (2H)
- VIII.3- Development of the concept of the protection of Human Person in Biomedical Research: From Nuremberg to the Huriet Law in France (2H)
- VIII.4- Risk Management / Beneficence/Nonmaleficence (2H)
- VIII.5- Social Justice (2H)
- VIII.6- Consent release for Research (2H)
- VIII.7- Conflict of Interest (1H)
- VIII.8- International Regulations (2H)
- VIII.9- National Legislation (2H)
- VIII.10- Decision Making, Complexity of Medical Practice and Society (3H)

E- Residents

Debates on burning issues in Seminars, Colloquia & Interdepartmental Rounds and Conferences

Faculty of Medicine

Educate in Bioethics / Obstacles

- **Determinant in the formation of an Ethical Reflection**

- Facing medical realities

- Daily practice of medicine & nursing care

- Observation of the behavior of physicians

- Observation of the behavior of nursing staff

- Personal experience of students

- However in the reality all these are missing & we are facing a severe deontological crisis at the LOP & Under the impact of the industrials and the practice in unjust health institutions → Outcome of this education*

- **Involve all the disciplines & health systems in this ethical formation**

- **Officially include this new discipline in the framework of medical studies.** For the time being any modifications of the program should get the approval of the Lebanese Cabinet that is subject to long process. The direct involvement of the Rector of the university, the President of CUEMB and the dean of the faculty is alleviating the impact of this factor.

Educate in Medical Ethics

In the Quest of the Human Person

- The ethical dimension is unique; it calls Man in his dignity which is defined **by the respect of Man in every man.**
- Multidisciplinary academic efforts are called to accomplish a common practical action addressed to an enlightened society in order to allow the Lebanese Man **“to live well in just and fair institutions”**.

